

JOHN KENNEDY

Noel Macainsh, "Select Bibliography of Excavations in the Townsville Area, North Queensland", *LINO*, Vol. 5, No. 2 (1976).

Dr Noel Macainsh is of course well known to scholars for his work on the decipherment of the so-called Nelly Bay Scrolls and the role he played in the discovery of the celebrated Pallarenda Man thigh bone. His "Select Bibliography of Excavations in the Townsville Area, North Queensland" has been eagerly awaited by everyone engaged in research on Townsvillian civilization in the pre-dynastic and early dynastic periods. Unfortunately, however, one has to report that the work contains a number of errors of detail, and that there are some surprising omissions.

Dr Ktistopopodopolous's initials are, of course, B.K., not K.B., as recorded here. It should have been made clear that the book published by J. Krummhorn in 1953 was the second, revised edition. Professor Taylor's *The Townsvillians* is, of course, volume 28 in the series "Ancient Peoples and Places", not volume 29.

It seems unfortunate that Dr Macainsh includes no work published earlier than 1953. Though superseded in some respects, the magisterial studies of the period by J.A. Braithwaite, *History of Townsville to 873 B.C.* (Oxford, 1896) and *The Civilization of Ancient Townsville* (3 volumes, London, 1902), still deserve the attention of every serious student. A. Dorfschulze's *Die Kunst des Nelly Bay* (Breslau, 1908) was written before the full significance of the Nelly Bay Bull was recognized, but it remains an indispensable handbook for anyone studying the art of the Second Intermediate Period. Nor can we afford to ignore Orville J. Cornheimer's *The Glory that was Garbutt* (Buffalo City, 1925), a work popular in the best sense of that much abused word.

Perhaps the most surprising aspect of Dr Macainsh's bibliography is, however, his apparent failure to consider recent work on the interrelationship of the civilizations of Townsville and Giru. In this regard one need only refer to Olav Olsen's *Giru og Nelly Bay* (Odense, 1968), A.M. Lofsen's *Giru och kultur i Nord Queensland* (Uppsala, 1973) and B.K. Taylor's *Giruvian Influences on Pre-dynastic Townsville Art* (Edinburgh, 1974). Perhaps I may also be permitted to mention my own forthcoming article, "The Nelly Bay seals again reconsidered: a rejoinder", to be published in the *Journal of the New Zealand Association for North Queensland Studies*.

Whilst, therefore, one is grateful for the work Dr Macainsh has performed, one must regretfully conclude that his bibliography cannot be

regarded as a definitive guide on which scholars in this rapidly expanding field may unhesitatingly rely.

(Mr Kennedy is a member of the School of North Queensland Studies, University of Sydney.)